South Carolina
Commission on Higher Education

CAAL
9/3/2009
Agenda Item 6

September 3, 2009

MEMORANDUM

To: Dr. Bettie Rose Horne, Chairman, Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing, and Members

From: Dr. Gail M. Morrison, Director, Academic Affairs and Licensing

Consideration of Report on Program Productivity, Fall 2004-Fall 2008

Background

In 2002, the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education adopted a new policy on program productivity which provides for the biennial review of enrollment and degrees awarded in all degree programs by all public four-year colleges and universities in South Carolina. The policy is on the Commission's website at
http://www.che.sc.gov/AcademicAffairs/Prog_Productivity_Policies_11-2002.doc.

The attached report provides a list of academic degree programs that have been identified through the review process as non-compliant with program productivity standards based on enrollment and the number of degrees awarded. Institutions were asked to review the identified programs, comment upon their continued viability, and report their intended actions for resolving productivity issues. This third biennial report covers the 2004 to 2008 period and contains findings from the Commission on Higher Education Management Information System (CHEMIS) program data, responses from the institutions, staff analysis, and staff recommendations for the continuation or termination of the identified programs.

Evaluation Policy and Procedures

The policy and procedures for this biennial academic degree program productivity review are identical to those used in the 2004 and 2006 analysis. They require programs offered at public four-year institutions in the state to be evaluated in terms of modest rolling five-year averages for enrollment and degrees awarded. The following criteria apply:

1. **Each baccalaureate program must either produce an average of at least 5 degrees awarded or enroll an average of 12.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**
2. **Each master's program must either produce an average of at least 3 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 6 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**
3. **Each doctoral program must either produce an average of at least 2 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 4.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**

Data sources used for this review are CHEMIS and the Commission's *Academic Degree Program Inventory*. **Academic degree programs that meet at least one of the two productivity standards automatically receive continuing approval status from the Commission.** Programs which fail to meet both the enrollment and degree completion criterion for the biennial review are either placed on probation (i.e., provisional approval status), recommended for termination, or, in very rare circumstances, exempted from program productivity standards. Institutions may on their own initiative decide to terminate underperforming programs of study at any time by notifying the Commission on Higher Education.

During the period of probation of an academic program, an institution is expected to enhance degree program enrollment and degrees awarded. A plan to enhance productivity is required to be submitted to the Commission within 60 days of the Commission's action declaring the program's probationary status. At the end of a program's probationary period, which may extend over a four-year period of two biennial reviews, the Commission will recommend either continuing approval status for programs meeting program productivity standards or, except in extenuating circumstances, termination of programs that failed to meet the standards in three consecutive biennial reviews. If warranted, the Commission will remove probationary status from programs as early as the next biennial program productivity review.

The Commission will entertain individual program exemptions to the academic program productivity standards under very limited circumstances and

then only if convincing justification can be provided. Programs approved for exemption must be 1) considered essential to the basic mission of the American university (i.e., the arts and sciences); 2) deemed so unique in their subject matter and value to the higher education community in South Carolina that at least one of them is essential to the State's program inventory; 3) considered pre-professional (e.g., Pre-Dentistry and Pre-Medicine) not as degree programs *per se* but as mechanisms for allowing students to leave the institution a year early for entering first-professional degree programs; or 4) represent "stop-out" Master's degrees for programs which typically graduate only at the doctoral level but provide "early out" opportunities to recognize students' accomplishments when they are unable to complete the terminal degree. It should be noted that any "uniqueness" criterion for exemption will rarely be applied to doctoral programs, which very infrequently duplicate each other and which have very modest productivity requirements (an average of 2 graduates or 4.5 enrolled students over a five-year period).

Program exemption requests may be filed for any degree level. They first must be approved by the chief academic officer and president of the institution and then sent in writing to the Commission. In most cases in which the Commission awards an exemption, it will be for the lifetime of the degree program. The awarding of exemptions is to be used very sparingly, however, because without a critical mass of students, even at the modest levels of the productivity standards, the quality of a program is too easily compromised in terms of curricular offerings, diversity of professors, student interactions, etc.

Summary of Process

For the current report, each university received a list of the non-compliant academic programs identified by the staff review for the 2004 to 2008 academic years. The institutions were requested 1) to review the list of programs; 2) to submit any corrections to the data; 3) and to inform staff whether each of the programs cited should be maintained, altered, terminated, or exempted from the policy.

In keeping with the 2006 guidelines for the program productivity review process, any program that received an average score no more than 0.2 points away from meeting enrollment or degrees awarded standards (as defined by the Commission) was rounded up to match the standard score and given full approval status.

Summary of Current Report Findings on Data from Fall 2004-2008

For the five-year period 2004-2008, this study found 722 programs of study eligible for analysis as programs which had been implemented for more than five

years. A total of 21 of these 722 programs (2.9%) were found to be non-compliant with enrollment and graduation standards, a decrease from the 3.9% of non-compliant programs identified in the 2006 reports. Across the State's thirteen public senior institutions, five (**Coastal Carolina University, College of Charleston, Lander University, USC-Aiken,** and **USC-Beaufort**) achieved 100% compliance ratings for their academic programs of study. These institutions are to be commended for their level of achievement. **Coastal Carolina University, College of Charleston, Lander University,** and **USC-Aiken** achieved total compliance in 2006 as well. Three institutions (The Citadel, Clemson, and Francis Marion) had only one program that was not compliant. Of the remaining institutions with non-compliant programs, two (SCSU and Winthrop) had two that were not compliant, and one (USC-Columbia) had 14 programs that were not compliant.

In response to the program productivity data analyzed during this review, MUSC terminated one program, SCSU terminated two programs, and Winthrop terminated one program. These terminated programs are not included in the totals below. The Commission commends these institutions for taking responsible actions in light of their respective programs' productivity performance.

Of the 21 non-compliant programs identified in this report, the sponsoring institutions *requested* that:
- 0 programs be *terminated*;
- 5 programs be recommended for *exemption*; and
- 16 programs be granted *provisional approval*.

For these programs the CHE staff *recommends* that:
- 0 programs be *terminated*;
- 2 programs receive *exempt* status; and
- 19 programs be placed on *provisional approval* status.

Program-specific results, institutional responses, and staff recommendations are presented on pages 7-21 of this report. Summary tables of all of the data are provided on pages 22-24. Institutional responses are summarized in the text.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission this report and the individual institutional recommendations contained herein.

4

Table 1:
Non-compliant Programs for Public Four-Year Institutions

Degree Level	Program	CIP	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
The Citadel						
Master	Mathematics Teacher Education	131311	4.6	2	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Clemson University						
Master	Polymer and Fiber Science	400599	5.4	1.8	Exemption	Exemption
Francis Marion University						
Bachelor	International Studies	450901	5.6	0.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
SC State University						
Bachelor	Art Teacher Education	131302	11.6	0.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master	Special Education	131001	3	1.4	Exemption	Provisional Approval
University of South Carolina						
Bachelor	European Studies	50106	2.2	0.6	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Latin American Studies	50107	5.8	1.8	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	French Language	160901	5.4	2.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	German Language	160501	4.2	2.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music Theory & Composition	500904	3.8	1.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music History	500902	1.4	0.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music, Piano Pedagogy	500999	3.6	1	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Conducting	500906	3.0	2.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Educational Research	130601	4.5	1.8	Exemption	Exemption
Master	Computer Software Engineering	140903	1	1.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Nursing Administration	511602	0.4	0	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Table 1:
Non-compliant Programs for Public Four-Year Institutions

Degree Level	Program	CIP	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	Institutional Request	Staff Recommendation
Master	Nursing-Community Mental Health and Psychology	511610	0.6	0.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Music Theory and Composition	500904	2.8	0.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Nuclear Engineering	142301	3.8	0.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Winthrop University						
Bachelor	Environmental Science	30104	12.2	2.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music Education	131312	4.8	1.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

THE CITADEL
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Master	Mathematics Teacher Education	131311	4.6	2	-	-	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 28
Non-compliant Programs: 1
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.6%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

The Citadel requests *exemption* for the program leading to the M.A.Ed. degree in Mathematics Teacher Education. The institution states that the program has provided professional development opportunities for certified secondary mathematics teachers in the Charleston area for more than two decades. The need for secondary mathematics teachers has never been more intense than now because mathematics is a critical needs teaching area and is central to all STEM as initiatives being developed at The Citadel and other institutions across the State. The Citadel is willing to continue to divert resources into this program to address the continuing need for secondary mathematics teachers.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges The Citadel's efforts to fill the need for Secondary mathematics teachers and recognizes that the institution is working with faculty to develop initiatives to improve enrollment and graduation averages in this program. However, this non-unique program does not meet policy standards for exemption. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

Staff Recommendation for The Citadel's Program:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the M.A.Ed. degree in **Mathematics Teacher Education** at The Citadel. The Citadel's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation.

CLEMSON UNIVERSITY
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Master	Polymer and Fiber Science	400599	5.4	1.8	-	-	Exemption	Exemption

Total Reviewed Programs: 154
Non-compliant Programs: 1
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 0.6%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Clemson University requests *exemption* for the program leading to the M.S. degree in Polymer and Fiber Science. The institution requests that CHE consider the recommendation of an exemption from program productivity standards based on the program's function as a "stop out" program for the doctoral degree in Polymer and Fiber Science. According to Clemson officials, the Master's degree in Polymer and Fiber Science is awarded to students who were originally enrolled in the doctoral program but chose not to complete the terminal degree. Clemson does not accept students for admission into this master's program.

Staff Response:

The program leading to the Master's degree in Polymer and Fiber Science represents a "stop out" degree for a program which typically graduates only at the doctoral degree level but provides opportunities to recognize students' accomplishments when they are unable to complete the doctoral degree. The precedent for this type of program is to grant an exemption.

Staff Recommendation for Clemson University's Program:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission *exemption* status for the program leading to the **Master of Science degree in Polymer and Fiber Science** at Clemson University.

FRANCIS MARION UNIVERSITY
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Bachelor	International Studies	450901	5.6	0.4	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 31
Non-compliant Programs: 1
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.2%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Francis Marion University requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the B.A. degree in International Studies. The institution states that the program is an interdisciplinary program that combines courses from other programs and imposes little or no additional cost on the University.

Staff Response:

While staff recognizes that this program imposes little additional cost to the institution, the relative cost of a program is not part of the standard for productivity status. Part of the intent of the standards is to ensure that the students in a program can count on a critical mass of colleagues and a focused academic experience. As this program did not meet productivity standards in 2006, provisional approval will give the program one reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

Staff Recommendation for Francis Marion University's Program:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the B.A. degree in **International Studies** at Francis Marion University. Francis Marion's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation.

SC STATE UNIVERSITY
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Bachelor	Art Education K-12	131302	11.6	0.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Master	Special Education	131001	3	1.4	-	-	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 52
Non-compliant Programs: 2
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.8%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

SC State University requests *exemption* for its program leading to the B.S. degree in Art Education K-12. The number of Art Education majors has grown from two in 2005 to twenty-one in 2007. The institution states that the growth can be largely attributed to the aggressive recruitment efforts by the newly hired art education specialist. The specialist has developed and continues to implement a comprehensive strategic plan to improve both student enrollment and graduation rates in the art education program.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's efforts and the upsurge of enrollment and completions numbers. However, this non-unique program does not meet policy standards for exemption. Staff has determined that a recommendation of provisional approval is more appropriate given the positive upward trend in enrollment, which will be expected to lead to a corresponding increase in graduates. Such approval will give the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

SC State University requests *exemption* for the program leading to the M.Ed. degree in Special Education. The institution states that the Special Education program continues to be a critical needs area and, as such, they can ill afford to discontinue the program. The State Department of Education offers a non-traditional program entitled Project Create that allows for alternative certification in this area, which may also contribute to the program's low enrollment. The institution is developing a plan to increase both enrollment and completions to include the following: revise the current curriculum to reflect the trends of the discipline; combine the three areas of study (disability, emotional disability, and mild retardation) in a cross-categorical model; and, recruit students

from the Project Create to seek the M.Ed. degree in Special Education at SCSU.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's development of significant plans to increase enrollment and completions. However, this non-unique program does not meet policy standards for exemption. Staff analysis of enrollment patterns in master's-level special education programs at Project Create participating institutions in South Carolina, including SCSU, has determined that the M.Ed. degree program at SCSU is the only special education program in the nine participating public institutions which does not meet productivity standards. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

Staff Recommendations for SC State University's Programs:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the programs leading to the:

- *Bachelor of Arts degree in Art Education K-12*

- *Master of Education degree in Special Education*

SCSU's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation.

USC-COLUMBIA
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Bachelor	European Studies	50106	2.2	0.6	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Bachelor	Latin American Studies	50107	5.8	1.8	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	French Language	160901	5.4	2.2	-	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	German Language	160501	4.2	2.2	-	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music Theory and Composition	500904	3.8	1.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music History	500902	1.4	0.2	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music, Piano Pedagogy	500999	3.6	1	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Conducting	500906	3.0	2.4	-	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Educational Research	130601	4.6	1.8	Provisional Approval	-	Exemption	Exemption
Master	Computer Software Engineering	140903	1	1.2	N/A	N/A	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Nursing Administration	511602	0.4	0	-	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Nursing-Community Mental Health and Psychology	511610	0.6	0.2	-	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Music Theory and Composition	500904	2.8	0.2	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Nuclear Engineering	142301	3.8	0.2	N/A	N/A	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 220
Non-compliant Programs: 14
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 6.4%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the B.A. degree in European Studies. The institution indicates that it has the only European Studies program in South Carolina. The program has increased the number of scholarships available to students and expanded involvement by faculty

with professional interests in European Studies. The institution explains that a major curriculum change has been approved that will make the major more accessible to foreign language students interested in double-majoring. In addition, the program has hosted several events of interest to students, faculty, and Columbia community members over the past two years, including a film series, faculty conferences, and visiting lecturers.

Staff Response:

While USC-Columbia has the only program leading to the B.A. degree in European Studies in the state, it is not the only university offering an extensive curriculum in the area. For example, the College of Charleston offers a minor in European Studies and has course offerings in the area that rival those of USC-Columbia in content and extent. The productivity data demonstrates that this program was provisionally approved during the 2004 and 2006 reporting periods and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards for the third cycle in a row. However, staff recognizes the institution's curriculum change for the program and its attempts to recruit additional students. While the productivity policy allows for a recommendation of termination, staff has determined that a recommendation of provisional approval is more appropriate given the plans for substantive changes presented above. Such approval will give the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards. Staff notes that the enrollment trend for the last three years has been to increase, but increases have been slight and the program is still far from meeting the enrollment standard. If the program's productivity does not increase dramatically in the next cycle, staff will recommend termination of this program.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the B.A. degree in Latin American Studies.** The institution states that in order to increase visibility of the program, the Latin American Studies program, along with other area studies programs, was administratively subsumed within the Walker Institute for International and Area Studies. USC-Columbia reports that it plans to reexamine the curricular requirements, increase the number of scholarships available to program majors, and expand involvement by faculty with professional interests in Latin American Studies. In addition, the name is to be changed to "Latin American, Latino/a, and Caribbean Studies" to reflect a broader scope within the major. The program changes proposed by the Latin American Studies faculty, including the program name change and curricular reform, were placed on hold in anticipation of a planned external review of the program. That review took place in January 2009, and the subsequent review report was submitted last month to the Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences. Although

formal feedback from the Dean is not yet available, several curricular changes informally recommended by the reviewer have already been implemented or are in progress.

Staff Response:

The productivity data demonstrates that this program was provisionally approved during the 2004 and 2006 reporting periods and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards for the third cycle in a row. However, staff recognizes the institution's development of significant new plans to increase enrollment and completions. While the productivity policy allows for a recommendation of termination, staff has determined that a recommendation of provisional approval is more appropriate given the plans for substantive changes presented above. Such approval will give the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards. Staff notes that the enrollment and completion trends for the last three years have been to **decrease** and that even at their highest level over the last five years the program was far from meeting either standard. If the program's productivity does not increase dramatically in the next cycle, staff will recommend termination of this program.

USC-Columbia Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.A. degree in French Language. The institution states that the program is very close to the minimum requirements; the shortfall is caused in part by the timing of the awarding of the degrees. A degree was just awarded recently to a student whose progress had been on hold for several years. Current enrollments in the program are up due in part to returnees from Fulbright study in France. The institution reports that the program now has between 8-10 students moving toward degree completion.

Staff Response:

Staff agrees with the institution's request for *provisional approval* for this program. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.A. degree in German Language. The institution states that the Master of Arts degree in German represents an important offering of a graduate program in a European language, and both the major enrollments and the completions averages over the past five years are close to the state standard minimums. The German program is working to increase enrollments by stepping up its recruitment

14

efforts at regional undergraduate institutions with German majors. The program is also strengthened by an exchange agreement with the University of Bochum, Germany, in close cooperation with the Comparative Literature program at USC. Establishing stronger ties with the Comparative Literature program, which offers a Ph.D., has already drawn a greater number of applicants to the German master's program. In fact, the German M.A. program estimates that almost half of its students choose to go on into the Ph.D. program in Comparative Literature. This cooperation should continue to increase both the quantity and quality of applicants to the program.

Staff Response:

The staff acknowledges that foreign language programs are important to the state as well as to teaching and employment across many professions and agrees with the institution's request for *provisional approval*. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the programs leading to the M.M. degree in Music Theory, M.M. degree in Music History, M.M. degree in Conducting, and the M.M. degree in Piano Pedagogy. The Dean of the School of Music is working with the accrediting body, the National Association of Schools of Music, to identify an acceptable solution for merging all of the smaller Masters of Music programs into a single generic degree program with concentrations. This move will ensure that the major's enrollment average will meet the minimum standards in the next productivity cycle. In expectation of the proposed consolidation of the Master of Music degrees, the institution is requesting that these programs receive an interim exception to the program productivity standards.

Staff Response:

The staff acknowledges the efforts the Dean of the School of Music is making to create a generic program leading to the Master of Music degree with concentrations. Although each of these programs is eligible for recommendation of termination under the program productivity policy, staff recommends provisional status in order to give the institution time to achieve approval from the accrediting body, the National Association of Schools of Music, to merge the programs. Any such merger should be submitted to the Commission along with appropriate documentation as required by the program productivity policy and the Commission's *Policies and Procedures for New Academic Program Approval and Program Termination*.

USC-Columbia requests *exemption* for the program leading to the M.Ed. degree in Educational Research. The institution states that this program is the only M.Ed. degree in Educational Research in the state, and thus is a critical program.

Staff Response:

USC-Columbia has the only program leading to the M.Ed. degree in Educational Research in the state. The University also offers a robust doctoral program in educational research that is well-enrolled, so concerns about lack of a critical mass of students, faculty diversity, resources, and the other elements of a high quality program are alleviated. Staff agrees with the institution's analysis that the program meets the "unique program" and "value" requirements for *exemption*.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.S. degree in Software Engineering. The institution states that the program was initially established during 2000-2001, at the height of the dot-com craze, and at the time was viewed largely as a path for non-traditional students working in IT to get a master's degree with a strong practical orientation. When the dot-com bubble burst, and a large number of the IT companies retrenched, interest in the program receded. In June 2008, the department established a dual M.S.E. degree program with the Tsinghua University in Beijing, China. This international agreement allows for students to begin an M.S.E. degree at Tsinghua and then transfer to USC for the last year (two regular semesters plus a summer), thereby satisfying the requirements for the USC degree. Initial projections for 15 program participants expected to arrive from China in Fall 2008 for this brand new program proved overly optimistic. In order to give the Tsinghua students another opportunity to earn this dual degree, department faculty and the Dean are requesting one more year of provisional approval. If the number of applications for Fall 2010 is so low as not to justify the M.S.E. program, the department will discontinue the M.S.E.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's efforts to increase the foreign participation in this program and compliments them on setting a one-year deadline for growth or termination. Staff agrees with the institution's request for *provisional approval*.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.S.N. degree in Nursing Administration. The institution states that the

College of Nursing has taken direct action to increase program productivity in this leadership development degree program for nursing executives. In 2007, a Nursing Administration Revision Task Force was established to evaluate the current program in relation to the knowledge, skills, and abilities that nurse leaders need in the current healthcare system. A significant outcome of the review by the Task Force was a general consensus that the original program of study was out of date. In fact, a newer term, "organizational leadership," is now more current in the discipline and more effectively describes the attributes that nurse leaders need to be successful. Additionally, College of Nursing faculty members, in direct response to their service provider needs, have determined that healthcare systems analysis is a primary focus for teaching, research and practice. Based on the review and these additional factors, the Nursing faculty have agreed that the M.S.N. program is an essential foundation for the Doctorate of Nursing Practice in organizational leadership. Efforts are underway to redesign and update the M.S.N. program of study to reflect the organizational leadership focus. New courses have been formulated and are being designed for on-line course delivery.

Staff Response:

Staff applauds the College of Nursing's efforts to review and redesign the program in order to increase student enrollment and completions. Given the stated importance of this program, it is critical that the redesign and recruiting efforts proceed rapidly. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the M.S.N. degree in Nursing-Community Mental Health and Psychology.** The institution states that awareness in our healthcare system of the urgent need for community health nurses is becoming more widespread. The Midlands has witnessed the closure of many mental health hospitals and facilities. Many of the formerly hospitalized clients now need care in their local communities. It is vital that the College of Nursing retain the capacity to educate these caregivers. In order to attract students to this major, the Psychiatric/ Mental Health Nursing specialists on the faculty have been tasked by the College with reviewing the curriculum related to the specialty educational standards and making recommendations for changes. Community mental health nursing is already a track in the Doctorate in Nursing Practice (D.N.P.) program. It is anticipated that the faculty recommendations will lead to the development of an M.S.N./D.N.P. career ladder in community mental health. Given the vacancies in this field of high demand and need, enrollments in the M.S.N. program are expected to increase upon implementation of the revised curriculum.

Staff Response:

     Staff recognizes the significant curricular actions planned to be taken by the College of Nursing to review and redesign the program, which are expected to increase enrollment and completions. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

     USC-**Columbia requests** *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the D.M.A degree in Music Composition.** The institution states that student numbers have been affected by recent faculty retirements. The department will recruit new faculty in the near term and it is expected that student enrollments will increase. Increasing enrollment is a matter of high priority for the department, as this program is considered among the best in the Southeast.

Staff Response:

     Staff acknowledges the institution's explanation for the program's declining enrollment and completions. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

     USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the Ph.D. degree in Nuclear Engineering.** The institution states that the Ph.D. program in Nuclear Engineering (N.E.) is comparatively new, having opened in Fall 2003. The average length of study for the Ph.D. is about five years. With the addition of a new tenure track faculty member in Nuclear Engineering in Fall 2009, the recruiting of additional Nuclear Engineering Ph.D. students is expected to increase. This trend is expected to continue as additional faculty candidates are currently being considered, and the number of tenure track Nuclear Engineering faculty will rise into 2011. Also, the needs are increasing for Ph.D. graduates at the national labs such as Savannah River National Laboratory, due to new programs related to energy and national security that require highly qualified staffing.

Staff Response:

     This is the first productivity cycle for which this relatively new program is eligible for review. According to the response, the institution has taken efforts to increase enrollment and completions, and these efforts will continue into the future. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

Staff Recommendations for USC-Columbia's Programs:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission:

1. *Exemption* for the program leading to the Master of Arts degree in **Educational Research.**

2. *Provisional approval* for the programs leading to the:
   - Bachelor of Arts degree in **European Studies;**
   - Bachelor of Arts degree in **Latin American Studies;**
   - Master of Arts degree in **French Language;**
   - Master of Music degree in **Music Theory and Composition;**
   - Master of Music degree in **Music History;**
   - Master of Music degree in **Piano Pedagogy;**
   - Master of Music degree in **Conducting;**
   - Master of Arts degree in **German Language;**
   - Master of Arts degree in **Computer Software Engineering;**
   - Master of Arts degree in **Nursing Administration;**
   - Master of Arts degree in **Nursing – Community Health and Psychology;**
   - Doctor of Philosophy degree in **Music Composition;** and
   - Doctor of Philosophy degree in **Nuclear Engineering.**

For each program awarded *provisional approval*, USC-Columbia's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation.

Winthrop University
Non-compliant Programs

Degree Level	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	2006 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Bachelor	Environmental Science	30104	12.2	2.4	N/A	N/A	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Master	Music Education	131312	4.8	1.4	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 56
Non-compliant Programs: 2
Percent of reviewed programs that were Non-compliant: 3.6%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

Winthrop University requests *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the B.S. degree in Environmental Science.** The institution states that the program, which was implemented in Fall 2001, is building enrollment and producing graduates at an acceptable level. There were five graduates during the 2007-2008 academic year and that same number of degree recipients is expected again in 2008-2009. The lack of graduates in 2003-2004, which was only the third year of the program, lowered the five-year average significantly. Winthrop plans to continue to monitor enrollments and degree production and address issues of concerns during the next program review cycle.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes that the institution has developed efforts to increase program enrollment and completions over the last two years, and that the program will meet productivity standards in the next cycle if the current enrollment trend is maintained. Provisional approval will give the program a minimum of two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

Winthrop University requests *provisional approval* **for the program leading to the M.M.E. degree in Music Education.** Winthrop has plans in place to address productivity issues in the Master of Music Education program. The enrollment for the program showed an increase in Fall 2007 and 2008, and Winthrop expects the degree completion numbers to follow suit. The program has experienced a change in leadership within recent years and is undergoing substantive curriculum changes to meet the needs of the prospective student populations more effectively. The institution will submit a planning summary to CHE in October 2009 outlining these modifications and follow in early spring with a full proposal for the modifications.

Staff Response:

According to the institution, Winthrop has taken actions over the previous two years, including increased student recruitment and changes in coursework, which have resulted in improved productivity in this program. While the productivity policy allows for a recommendation of termination after three cycles of non-compliance, staff has determined that a recommendation for provisional approval is more appropriate. Such approval will give the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards and implement the projected major curriculum changes.

Staff Recommendations for Winthrop University's Programs:

The staff recommends that the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commend favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* for the programs leading to the:

- Bachelor of Science degree in **Environmental Science** and
- Master of Music Education degree in **Music Education.**

Winthrop's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation.

Table 2:
The Number of Non-Compliant Degree Programs Identified for the Five-year Period, 2004-2008

Institution	Bachelor	Master	Doctoral	Total
Citadel	-	1	-	1
Clemson	-	1	-	1
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	1	-	-	1
Lander	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	-	-
SC State	1	1	-	2
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-
USC-Beaufort	-	-	-	-
USC-Columbia	2	10	2	14
USC-Upstate	-	-	-	-
Winthrop	1	1	-	2
Total Non-compliant	5	14	2	**21**

Total Programs: 721
Percent Non-compliant: 2.9%

Table 3:
Staff Recommended Action Summary Table, 2004-2008

Institution	Termination	Exemption	Provisional Approval	Total
Citadel	-	-	1	1
Clemson	-	1	-	1
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	-	-	1	1
Lander	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	-	-
SC State	-	-	2	2
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-
USC-Beaufort	-	-	-	-
USC-Columbia	-	1	13	14
USC-Upstate	-	-	-	-
Winthrop		-	2	2
Total	-	2	19	21

Table 3:
Non-compliant Degree Programs Identified for the Five-year Period, By Field

Institution	Engineering	Foreign Language	Health Fields	Math	Music	Pre-Professional	Sciences	Social Sciences and Humanities	Teacher Education	Other
Citadel	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
Clemson	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-
Lander	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
SC State	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	-
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
USC-Columbia	2	2	2	-	5	-	-	2	1	-
USC-Upstate	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	-
Winthrop	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	1	-
Total	2	2	3	-	5	-	2	3	5	0

24